

EURASIAN RESEARCH JOURNAL
ERJ, Vol. 5, No. 2, pp. 61-79, Spring 2023

<https://doi.org/10.53277/2519-2442-2023.2-05>

IRSTI 11.25.47

ISSN 2519-2442, KAZAKHSTAN

Research Article

**THE POLITICAL VISION OF THE ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC
STATES: AN ANALYSIS OF THE TURKIC WORLD VISION 2040**

Firat YALDIZ¹

¹ Kastamonu University, 37150 Kastamonu, Türkiye

firatyaldiz@gmail.com

ORCID: 0000-0001-5152-2050

Received: 02.04.2023

Accepted: 18.05.2023

ABSTRACT

After 1991, the phenomenon of the Turkic world turned from an ideological dream to a political reality, with the independent Turkic states becoming equal and sovereign subjects in the international system and international politics. In this process, many cooperation organizations (TURKSOY, TURKPA, TWESCO, etc.) were established among the Turkic states. The Organization of Turkic States (OTS), established in 2009 as the umbrella organization of the Turkic world cooperation organizations, became even stronger with the membership of Uzbekistan in 2019. The 2021 Istanbul Summit and 2022 Samarkand Summit of the OTS are extremely important for the future of cooperation in the Turkic world. In this study, the political vision for the OTS and the Turkic World Vision - 2040 will be analyzed.

Keywords: Istanbul Summit, OTS, Turkic States, Turkic World, Turkic World Vision – 2040.

INTRODUCTION

The Turkic states became independent after the dissolution of the USSR in 1991, which marked the beginning of an important and new era for the Turkic world. In this new period, many regional cooperation institutions have been established, especially under the leadership of Türkiye. First and foremost, the International Turkic Cultural Organization (TURKSOY), the International Turkic Academy, the Turkic world Parliamentary Assembly (Turk-Pa), the Turkish Culture and Heritage Foundation, the Turkish Investment Fund and the Organization of Turkic States (OTS) has formed the institutional infrastructure of regional cooperation. Among these (Turkic world) cooperation organizations that emerged in fields such as culture, science, art, diplomacy, and common heritage, OTS comes to the fore both in terms of its institutional structure and is an umbrella organization, as well as in terms of political representation and cooperation in the context of the Turkic states (Kocaman, 2021).

The institutional cooperation efforts and political vision of OTS, directly and indirectly, affect the cooperation organizations of the Turkic world. In this study, the Organization of Turkic states, which is the umbrella organization of the Turkic world cooperation institutions, and the Turkic World Vision – 2040 will be emphasized. Therefore, the cooperation endeavors in the Turkic world and Turkic world cooperation organizations will be examined in line with the new institutionalism theory through which Turkic World Vision - 2040 will be analyzed.

The new institutionalism theory has been included in the discipline of international relations, especially in the context of the formation and development of the institutional structure of the European Union (EU). The discussions about the position of institutions in foreign policy and their role in international relations have become increasingly important in the international relations discipline and literature. In this context, the EU, which is a strong and important example of the institutionalization of the European region and its states in the international system, has entered the research area of new institutionalism (Mercan, 2011: 75-76) and has become a unique area where the assumptions of institutionalism theory are tested with its formal and informal institutions (Açıkmese, 2004: 21). The new institutionalism, which is based on a theoretical ground that has been increasingly examined in the discipline of international relations with the EU process, has become a theory in which the word ‘institution’ has expanded not only as an organization but also to include norms, principles, and values established at the EU level.

Thus, three main new institutionalist approaches called neo-institutionalism and criticizing the formal view of the classical institutionalist approach, began to be used as a unit of analysis and conceptual framework in international relations. Accordingly, the first new institutionalist analysis, supported by rational choice theory, assumes that individuals (or states at the international level) who act in their own interests and aim to provide maximum benefit are central actors in the political process and that institutions emerge as a result of interdependence and strategic interaction. Rational choice institutionalists in international relations have been particularly influenced by developments in the new institutional economy (Schneider and Ershova, 2018). Second, historical institutionalism represents a cultural approach. Rather than being the result of

strategic calculations about it, institutions provide moral or cognitive patterns for interpretation and action. The distinguishing feature of historical institutionalism is that it allows for historical possibilities, emphasizes dependent options, and thus focuses on the continuity of institutions. Historical institutionalism does not ignore the impact of the historical roots of existing international organizations on international relations (Suddaby et al., 2014: 100-123). Finally, normative institutionalism directs the influence of international relations from rationality and efficiency of the role of norms and values. The primary focus of normative institutionalism is on the ways in which institutions constrain individual choice. While normative institutionalism considers an institutional change in the context of learning, it also reminds us that existing institutions tend to structure the field of vision of individuals contemplating change. Many international norms that set the standards for the appropriate behavior of states are based on local norms and internationalized through the efforts of different entrepreneurs, including non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and transnational advocacy networks. The interplay between national and international norms also functions differently, as states “socialize to accept new norms, values, and perceptions of their interests”. There are three areas of international relations research in which these various types of institutionalism and the questions outlined are answered. The first is the domain of the state sovereignty. The sovereignty of the state can be understood broadly as a fundamental institution that drives international relations. This understanding may seem like accepting the basic arguments and terms of realism, but institutionalists do not conceive of sovereignty as a given structure but as a social construction. The second area is the area of international regimes. International regimes shift their focus to institutions based on international values and facilitating interstate cooperation and coordination. Third, it is the global and/or regional institutions that provide the unification of these areas. The European Union, which is a regional regime in which state sovereignty is relatively transferred and abandoned, can be shown as an exemplary institutional structure in terms of the combination of the first two areas. In recent years, the EU has emerged as an institution that has been examined especially with its institutional analysis dimension (Schimmelfennig and Thomas, 2011: 177-191). In this context, if we need to examine the institutional developments that shape the Turkic world according to the new institutionalism theory, it can be said that the Turkic states are in partnership as equal sovereign states and the Turkic world is symbolized with the active participation of the Heads of State of the Turkic states in harmony with the state sovereignty. Secondly, the partnership and cooperation of Turkic states is evolving towards a regional cooperation area that is compatible with international politics and based on international values. Thirdly, the institutional structures that provide the combination of the first two areas gain importance. It is important that the Turkic world cooperation institutions were established after 1991; among these institutions, OTS stands out as an umbrella organization. Turkic World Vision - 2040, which reveals the common vision of Turkic world cooperation institutions by OTS, is of great importance in this respect (Yaldiz and Yaldiz, 2020: 75-97).

THE COOPERATION IN THE TURKIC WORLD

After the collapse of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics in 1991, Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, and Turkmenistan declared their

independence and Türkiye was the first state to recognize the independence of these new Turkic states. Thousands of years of the historical, social, and cultural partnerships between these states and societies formed the basis of relations after 1991 (Yaldiz and Ozen, 2021). After 1991, “the Summits of the Heads of Turkic Speaking States” became the political starting point of the cooperation in the Turkic world.

During his visit to the newly independent Turkic states in 1992, Süleyman Demirel, then the Prime Minister of Türkiye, started to organize these summits. The first summit was held in Ankara on October 30, 1992, attended by the Presidents of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, and Turkmenistan, and the President of the Republic of Türkiye Turgut Ozal and Prime Minister Demirel and ended with the signing of the Ankara Declaration. It is an important point to emphasize that Türkiye has an active role in the cooperation institutions of the Turkic world. According to Balcer (2012), cooperation between Turkic states has started to institutionalize mostly with the initiative of Türkiye. Köstem also states that Türkiye’s Eurasian policy after the USSR was influenced by the idea of the Turkic world and was quickly internalized by various political actors in Türkiye and moreover, although the geopolitical importance of the region for Türkiye has decreased, the idea of the Turkic world has gained a “taken for granted” status in Türkiye’s foreign policy interests and practices (Köstem, 2017: 722). The participants of the Summits of the Heads of Turkic Speaking States aimed to strengthen relations and develop cooperation on the basis of the independence, sovereignty, respect for territorial integrity and non-interference in internal affairs. At another summit held in Bishkek in August 1995, the need to preserve the great cultural and historical heritage of the Turkic people was repeated and all parties expressed their readiness to cooperate and develop relations. The 6th Summit, which was held in Astana in 1998, has been followed by many summits until today, and in this process, many cooperation organizations have been established with the political will and approval of the Heads of State.

The International Organization of Turkic Culture (TURKSOY) was established in 1993, in Ankara – Türkiye. The founding agreement signed by the Ministers of Culture of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, and Türkiye. Later on, the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (TRNC) and the autonomous republics of the Russian Federation (Tatarstan, Bashkortostan, Altai, Sakha, Tyva, and Khakassia) as well as the Autonomous Territorial Unit of Gagauzia (Moldova) joined TURKSOY as member states with an observer status (TURKSOY, 2023). The activities and efforts of TURKSOY are determined by the Permanent Council and are implemented by the TURKSOY Secretariat. The first concrete step of the institutionalization efforts towards the Turkic world was taken with the establishment of TURKSOY. It is particularly important that an institution was established on the common denominator of Turkic culture in 1993, right after the Turkic states gained their independence. The Cultural Capitals of the Turkic world endeavor (Yaldiz, 2020), is the most important and most valuable work of TURKSOY. This process started with the declaration of Astana (Kazakhstan) as the Cultural Capital of the Turkic world in 2012, followed by Eskişehir (Türkiye) in 2013, Kazan (Tatarstan) in 2014, Merv (Turkmenistan) in 2015, Sheki (Azerbaijan) in 2016, Turkistan (Kazakhstan) in 2017, Kastamonu (Türkiye) in 2018, Osh (Kyrgyzstan) in 2019, Khiva (Uzbekistan) in 2020, Bursa (Türkiye) in 2022 and Shusha (Azerbaijan) in 2023.

The Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic States (TURKPA) was established on 21 November 2008 with the Agreement signed by the Presidents of the Parliaments of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Türkiye; its Secretariat is in Baku - Azerbaijan (TURKPA, 2023). TURKPA was established to increase cooperation between the parliaments of Turkic states and to strengthen parliamentary diplomacy.

The Turkic world Educational and Scientific Cooperation Organization (TWESCO) was established on May 25, 2010 under Kazakhstan's Ministry of Education and Science. Upon the proposal of Nursultan Nazarbayev, then the President of Kazakhstan, at the OTS meeting held in 2009 to establish an international scientific center tasked with conducting research on the Turkic world and gained international organization status on August 28, 2014 (TWESCO, 2023).

The International Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation (ITCHF) was established at the OTS meeting held in Kyrgyzstan – Bishkek in 2012. ITCHF carries out its activities in Azerbaijan – Baku with the aim of “preserving, researching, and supporting Turkish culture and heritage through the activities, projects, and programs it supports and finances” (ITCHF, 2023).

The Turkic Investment Fund (TIF) was established at the 9th OTS Summit on November 11, 2022 held in Samarkand – Uzbekistan. The TIF is the first and main joint financial institution established by the Turkic states, which aims to mobilize the economic potential, to strengthen the trade and economic cooperation and to implement joint projects between the member states of the Organization of Turkic States (OTS, 2022).

As explained above, from the establishment of TURKSOY in 1993 and the Turkic Investment Fund in 2022, many organizations were created to provide and develop cooperation between the Turkic states in different fields. The last meeting of the Coordination Committee of Organizations of the Turkic Cooperation, which was established to ensure coordination between these institutions (OTS, TURKSOY, TURKPA, TWESCO, ITCHF), was held on January 20, 2023, in Istanbul.

THE ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC STATES

The Organization of Turkic States is the most important organization of the Turkic world. The Summits of the Heads of Turkic Speaking States are the basis of the OTS, which has the role of an umbrella organization to which other Turkic world organizations are affiliated/related with. The OTS was established with the Nakhchivan Agreement on October 3, 2009. Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, and Türkiye are the members; Hungary (2018), Turkmenistan (2021), and TRNC (2022) are the observer members of the OTS. The Council of Heads of State, the Council of Foreign Ministers, the Council of Elders, the Senior Officials Committee, and The Secretariat are the principal organs of the OTS (OTS, 2021).

In this context, the situation of Uzbekistan, which became a member of OTS in 2019, 10 years after OTS was established (in 2009), has a special importance. It

is vital for the OTS that Uzbekistan participates in the Turkic world cooperation, albeit belatedly, politically, and institutionally. In addition, Uzbekistan's point of view to make structural reforms during the 2023 chairmanship term of the OTS, is valuable in terms of the effectiveness and efficiency of the cooperation of the Turkic world and the Turkic states, as well as the institutional structure and functioning of the organization ².

The main purposes and tasks of the OTS set out in Article 2 of the Nakhchivan Agreement are as follows (OTS, 2020):

- strengthening mutual confidence, friendship and good-neighborliness among the Parties;
- maintaining peace, strengthening security and confidence in the region and in the world as a whole;
- search for common positions on foreign policy issues of mutual interest, including those in the framework of international organizations and at international forums;
- coordination of actions to combat international terrorism and separatism, extremism, trafficking in human beings, drug trafficking, as well as the assistance to international policy on control over illicit traffic in narcotic drugs and psychotropic substances;
- promotion of effective regional and bilateral cooperation in political, trade and economic, law enforcement, environmental, cultural, scientific-technical, military, technical, educational, energy, transportation, credit and finance areas and other areas of common interest;
- creation of favorable conditions for trade and investment, further simplification of Customs and transit procedures aiming at facilitation of movement of goods, capital, services and technologies, and simplification of financial and banking operations;
- aiming for comprehensive and balanced economic growth, social and cultural development in the region through joint actions on the basis of equal partnership in order to steadily increase and improve the living conditions of the peoples of the Parties;
- discussing questions of ensuring the rule of law and good governance and guaranteeing human rights and fundamental freedoms in accordance with generally recognized principles and norms of international law;
- expansion of interaction in the field of science and technology, education, health, culture, sports and tourism;
- encouragement of interaction of the mass media and communication of the Parties in promoting, popularizing and disseminating the great cultural and historical heritage of the Turkic peoples;
- discussing questions of exchange of legal information for the development of interaction and mutual legal assistance, and cooperation in various spheres of law.

² The speech of Uzbekistan President Mirziyoyev who is the chairman of OTS 2023, at the 2022 Samarkand Summit of the OTS with the participation of the Heads of State has been the initiator of this process. The political analysis of Mirziyoyev's speech reveals important clues for the progress of the cooperation process in the Turkic world and make analyzes and predictions about the future of the OTS and the Turkic world. The content of the speech of Mirziyoyev is excluded from the scope of this study, as it could be a subject of another study.

The conceptual, historical, political, and legal foundations of the Turkic cooperation organizations constitute an important infrastructure in terms of the content of the concept of the Turkic world and contribute to the construction of the national and international dimensions of the Turkic identity. The OTS's web page includes nineteen topics under the title of the Areas of Cooperation:

Table 1. *Areas of Cooperation of the OTS*

№	Area of Cooperation
1.	Political Cooperation
2.	Economic Cooperation
3.	Customs Cooperation
4.	Transport Cooperation
5.	Tourism Cooperation
6.	Education Cooperation
7.	Information and Media Cooperation
8.	Youth and Sports Cooperation
9.	Diaspora Cooperation
10.	Cooperation in Information and Communication Technologies (ICT)
11.	Energy Cooperation
12.	Health Cooperation
13.	Migration Cooperation
14.	Agricultural Cooperation
15.	Cooperation on Justice
16.	Cooperation on Humanitarian Issues and Development
17.	Cooperation in the Field of Human Resources
18.	Cooperation among Muslim Religious Institutions
19.	Cooperation with International Organizations

As can be seen in the aforementioned table, OTS has comprehensively structured the areas of cooperation between the Turkic states and embodied the objectives of cooperation in a total of nineteen titles. The structuring of these cooperation areas in very different and diverse fields such as trade, tourism, migration, diaspora, health, agriculture, by going beyond political and economic cooperation, is of great importance for the future of the Turkic world and the institutional value of OTS.

It is an important shortcoming that OTS does not include cooperation on democracy, rule of law, freedoms and human rights within these comprehensive cooperation areas. However, it is of great importance for the global prestige of the Turkic world in the 21st century that the Turkic world has become a geographical and political region where democracy and democratic values are cared for on a constitutional ground that is compatible with international law and international human rights law, especially where fundamental rights and freedoms are secured and guaranteed. (This missing topic has been poorly and inadequately addressed in the Political and Security Cooperation section in Turkic World Vision – 2040).

As a matter of fact, the comprehensive cooperation areas specified by OTS have been emphasized in detail in the Turkic World Vision – 2040, under the auspices of the Turkic Heads of State, with the phrase “We, the Heads of State of the Organization of Turkic States”. Turkic World Vision – 2040, the focus of this article, which is under the auspices of Turkic Heads of State with this clear expression, will be examined in detail below.

TURKIC WORLD VISION – 2040

The 8th Summit of the Organization of Turkic States (in which the name of the Turkic Speaking States Cooperation Council was changed to the Organization of Turkic States), convened in Istanbul on 12 November 2021 with the theme of Green Technologies and Smart Cities in the Digital Age. According to Beylur (2021), “one of the most important results of the Summit that should be emphasized is undoubtedly the Turkic World Vision - 2040 adopted by the member states.” The long (seventeen pages in total) and detailed Turkic World

Table 2. *Areas of Cooperation of the 2040 Turkic World Vision*

Political and Security Cooperation	Political Cooperation Security Cooperation
Economic and Sectoral Cooperation	Economic Cooperation Transport and Customs Information and Communication Technologies Energy Tourism Health Environment Agriculture
People-to-People Cooperation	Culture Education and Science Youth and Sports Diaspora Information and Media Civil Society Organizations
Cooperation with External Parties	International Organizations Humanitarian and Development Cooperation

Vision – 2040 (OTS, 2023), which was accepted at this summit (2021 Istanbul Summit), contains very important statements regarding the goals of the Turkic world for the next 20 years. The Turkic World Vision – 2040, based on four pillars and the eighteen areas of cooperation listed under these pillars provide the most comprehensive strategic approach that has been put forward since the Turkic states gained their independence in 1991.

THE POLITICAL AND SECURITY COOPERATION

The Political and Security Cooperation pillar consists of the Political Cooperation and Security Cooperation sections. In the section on the Political Cooperation, there is a special emphasis on strengthening global and regional cooperation of common interest among OTS member states and increasing synergies between national institutions and other stakeholders. Also included in this column are cooperation on strengthening the rule of law, judicial systems, legal infrastructure, and institutional capacities in OTS member States. In this context, it is aimed to ensure effective cooperation and coordination between other Turkic cooperation institutions (TURKSOY, Turkic Academy, Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation, and TURKPA) in order to advance cooperation in cultural, academic, and parliamentary spheres. In addition, it was also stated that increased cooperation with other regional (European) and global (UN) organizations and carrying out tangible joint projects.

In the Security Cooperation section, building a network for cooperation and information sharing among the Member States’ law enforcement authorities to combat the threats of radicalization, violent extremism, Islamophobia, xenophobia and terrorism, transnational organized crime, including the illegal

drug trade, irregular migration, human trafficking, illicit arms trade, organ trafficking, economic, financial and cybercrimes, and to ensure border security are highlighted. Another detail that should be mentioned in this context is that the military-technical cooperation between the Turkic states has become one of the important developing cooperation areas before the Turkic World Vision - 2040, especially in the post-1991 period (Kocatepe, 2022).

The fact that these cooperation areas have been put under the title of Political and Security Cooperation reveals that political cooperation is not based on human rights and freedoms, but security-centered. However, the separation of these two fields (political cooperation and security cooperation) and the establishment of political cooperation based on democracy, rule of law, fundamental rights, and freedoms are important for the Turkic world to become a regional and global actor in the next two decades and beyond.

THE ECONOMIC AND SECTORAL COOPERATION

The Economic and Sectoral Cooperation pillar consists of eight sections: (i) Economic Cooperation, (ii) Transport and Customs, (iii) Information and Communication Technologies, (iv) Energy, (v) Tourism, (vi) Health, (vii) Environment, and (viii) Agriculture.

The Economic Cooperation covers many subjects such as working towards achievement of free movement of commodities, capital, services, technologies and people among the OTS Member States; providing exchange of experience and best practices in national economic development policies; developing financial and investment instruments for supporting private sector, fostering economic growth and socio-economic development, developing programs supportive to diaspora members, who are willing to start a business in their countries of origin, etc.

The Transport and Customs, mentions simplifying customs and transit procedures of the OTS Member States for border crossing; increasing investments for ensuring intra-regional connectivity with well-developed and interconnected hard and soft transport infrastructure projects among the OTS Member States; harmonizing transport policies and freight-related technical standards for the Trans-Caspian International East-West Middle Corridor; carrying out close cooperation to ensure effective implementation of international conventions in the field of transport by the OTS Member States and emphasizes promoting Zangazur Corridor at various international economic platforms by OTS Member States.

The Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) gives place to harmonize policies and regulations in the field of ICT by increasing cooperation among the regulators, public and private operators, and other relevant stakeholders of the OTS Member States; to develop e-government and e-services joint programs and projects with priority given to trade, transport, health and education; to increase partnerships on ICT services and infrastructure development, including broadcast services, mobile, satellite technologies, fiber optics, and develop joint ICT potential of the OTS Member States by creating a regional technological ecosystem through establishing joint cooperation

platforms and networks; to bring together leading research and development centers such as techno and IT parks to share experience and knowledge in digital matters, to enhance collaboration in cybersecurity to respond to regional security challenges by establishing a common platform in close cooperation with international cybersecurity centers; to achieve digital connectivity and communication through the effective use of space technologies in all spheres of social-economic life, and harmonize national space policies and establish result-oriented cooperation among the OTS Member States through joint programs and projects, including knowledge, experience and know-how sharing, capacity building programs; to establish cooperation mechanism among the OTS Member States with the aim to use common space-infrastructures, innovative space technology tools and share space-based data for resource management, disaster risk reduction and sustainable development; to encourage scientific cooperation in the area of space studies as well as joint research and study among the relevant authorities of the OTS Member States, including universities and space centers.

The Energy includes building strategic partnership among the OTS Member States in the field of energy through coordination of policies, promotion of energy trade, investments, joining the production of energy products, research and technological cooperation to provide secure, sustainable, competitive and affordable energy to the OTS Member States; developing strategic energy infrastructure projects in the region such as Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan, Baku-Tbilisi-Erzurum, Southern Gas Corridor and its components TANAP and TAP, to meet the demand of the OTS Member States, to provide them with alternative routes, as well as to contribute to European and global energy security; ensuring collaboration among the OTS Member States for energy diversification and clean/green energy, particularly in the field of renewable energy such as solar, bioenergy, wind, nuclear through joint investments, knowledge, experience and know-how exchanges; ensuring close cooperation between governments and private sectors for conducting research and innovation in order to reduce cost and increase the use of contemporary energy technologies, in particular those related to the energy efficiency and energy storage, and to establish joint production and distribution of petrochemical products; ensuring universal access to affordable clean/green energy carriers and end-use services for households and communities living in urban and rural areas; institutionalizing energy cooperation among the OTS Member States through the establishment of integrated Turkic Energy Market; establishing close cooperation with international organizations including but not limited to International Energy Agency (IEA), International Renewable Energy Agency (IRENA) and Energy Charter.

The Tourism gives place to reveal the ancient and contemporary cultural heritage of the region through various innovative tourism programs and projects; to develop and promote various types of tourism packages, cultural routes and tours in the field of eco-tourism, culinary tourism, adventure tourism, health tourism, spiritual/sacred tourism; to establish a network of cooperation among the relevant public and private authorities of the OTS Member States in order to attract investment, organize capacity-building programs, harmonize policies and regulations, as well as achieve common standards in the tourism sector; to establish an alliance of prominent touristic cities of the Turkic world to enhance the cooperation and ensure experience sharing among each other; to develop necessary policies, regulations, and incentives for making prices affordable for tourists visiting the OTS Member States, to enhance visa facilitation for

tourism purposes for the citizens of selected third parties to be implemented in accordance with national legislation of the OTS Member States and developing a common position to this end.

The Health mentions to strengthen human resources and institutional capacities in the health sector through the exchange of knowledge and best practices, joint capacity building and training programs and mobility of health professionals; to work on the harmonization of national policies and legislations for better development of healthcare infrastructure, communications and health information systems among the OTS Member States; to encourage joint investments, public-private partnership models and innovative financing for upgrading and modernizing healthcare industry, infrastructure and services in the OTS Member States; to build capacities and resilience of the national health systems to ensure emergency preparedness for prevention, detection and response to transnational health threats, including pandemics and other infectious diseases; to boost joint scientific cooperation, research and development programs among health institutions and universities to develop prevention, diagnosis, treatment methods, vaccines and other medications for existing and future challenges; to facilitate trade in medical goods, equipment and services in the region and beyond.

The Environment covers to give priority to environmental protection in the national and joint policies of the OTS Member States and take necessary measures to increase societal awareness on this global challenge; to take joint action to prevent and respond to natural and manmade disasters and to mitigate their effects and contribute to recovery through establishment of the OTS Civil Protection Mechanism; to preserve biodiversity by preventing uncontrolled pollution from the energy sector, household heating, industrial complexes, road traffic, incineration of waste and other toxic materials; to accelerate the use of green digital technologies for the benefit of the environment, and support the deployment of green digital solutions that accelerate the low-emitting energy networks, enable precision farming, decrease pollution, combat biodiversity loss, and optimize resource efficiency; to use the power of data in tackling societal, climate and environment-related challenges as well as contributing to healthier, more prosperous and more sustainable societies; to encourage urban development based on high-tech infrastructure and widespread access to smart technology while implementing urban policies that reduce resource and energy consumption, minimizes pollution and emissions and help cities become greener, inclusive, safe and resilient; to use instruments of green financing, transfer of green technologies in the implementation of the climate agenda of the OTS Member States; to develop a wide international exchange and a variety of the best technologies in the field of low carbon development, in particular in industry, agriculture, energy, transport, and renewable energy sources.

The Agriculture emphasizes mobilizing public and private institutions, academics, civil society organizations, research institutions, and farmer associations to achieve sustainable agricultural development; to develop organic farming as an agricultural method to produce food using natural substances and processes with a limited environmental impact, and maintain a strict control and enforcement system; to harmonize sustainable rural development programs and policies, promote modern practices and innovative technologies and encourage

productive linkages in the agricultural sector by establishing partnerships between agro-clusters, farmers, and agro-businesses; to establish effective collaboration with relevant international organizations such as FAO, IFAD, IOFS, and UNDP.

THE PEOPLE-TO-PEOPLE COOPERATION

The People-to-People Cooperation pillar consists of six sections: (i) Culture, (ii) Education and Science, (iii) Youth and Sports, (iv) Diaspora, (v) Information and Media, (vi) Civil Society Organizations.

The Culture gives place to develop joint social, cultural and educational activities by the relevant institutions of the OTS Member States to further discover the commonalities and enrich the sense of togetherness among the Turkic societies; to prepare a common list of the cultural heritage of the Turkic world, preserve this cultural heritage and take joint action for repatriating the cultural heritage of the Turkic world to their country of origin; to ensure strong coordination and cooperation among the relevant institutions of the OTS Member States and the Turkic Cooperation Organizations for submitting nominations to the Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity of UNESCO; to promote common Turkic heritage of the greatest scientists, poets, thinkers and artist, and nurture the OTS Member States' traditions, customs, folklore, and role of Turkic world on intercultural dialogue; to organize annual joint film festivals, music and art events as well as other similar cultural activities for bringing our peoples together.

The Education and Science mentions to harmonize the curriculum and credit system for better cooperation in the field of higher education among the OTS Member States, and encourage collaboration in diploma recognition and academic qualifications in the OTS Member States; to contribute to further development of education systems in the OTS Member States in accordance with international standards, introducing innovative methods of learning, critical thinking and practical use of technology; to intensify scientific and analytical researches on the common Turkic history, culture, language, literature and geography, and support elective courses on the subject matters in the school curricula in the OTS Member States; to make the Turkic Higher Education Space fully operational through Orkhun Process Exchange Program and render Turkic Universities Union (TURKUNIB) the leading cooperation mechanism; to enable the mobility of students, researchers, and academics through joint policies, and instruments including twinning programs, and organize competitions in different branches of science; to prepare educative videos on common Turkic history, geography, literature, values, culture and tradition, with creative and modern techniques to elicit greater interest from young students; to develop scientific publication data accessible for academics, researchers and students, and create a common international index for the scientific journals of the OTS Member States; to share their best experiences on entrepreneurship and vocational education and explore opportunities on the realization of joint projects on increasing skills and knowledge in this direction; to support the implementation of joint fundamental, practical, innovative and startup projects; to develop common innovative ecosystem, support the transfer of technology among the OTS Member States and encourage the commercialization of scientific results; to promote effective

intellectual property protection in accordance with international instruments; to create joint online open-access encyclopedia of the Turkic world; to accelerate the cooperation among think tanks and establish the Turkic world Think Tanks Network.

The Youth and Sports gives place to carry on projects tailored to empower the youth of the OTS Member States, to enhance cooperation and coordination among them, and to upgrade their skills such as entrepreneurship; to initiate various tournaments, championships, and activities in the different fields of sports to benefit the unifying power of sport for further convergence of the societies of the Turkic world; to institutionalize and operationalize the existing Youth Platform as an umbrella bringing together the Youth NGO's and ensure the sustainability of the youth and sports initiatives such as Turkic Universiade, Young Leaders Forum, Young Entrepreneurs Forum as well as youth camps and festivals; to build linkage of platforms for youth and ethno-sports of the OTS Member States with relevant regional and international initiatives customized to these fields; to institutionalize the organization of World Nomad Games initiated and founded by the Kyrgyz Republic and transform it into a world brand with an aim to present the ancient cultural heritage of the Turkic peoples to the whole world.

The Diaspora emphasizes developing a strategic framework for diaspora engagement and investment in the countries of origin; mobilizing academic diaspora to support the higher education and scientific institutions in the Turkic world and strengthening the linkages among diaspora academicians across the world; to ensure active involvement of the Turkic Diaspora communities in the relevant projects and programs of the Organization of Turkic States.

The Information and Media includes to benefit from the emerging and developing media for increasing awareness of the shared values, traditions, history and solidarity among citizens of Member States to showcase the advantages of Turkic cooperation and to encourage citizens towards closer interaction with sister societies and others; to strengthen cooperation among the public and private media institutions of the OTS Member States; to build new media partnerships, enhance mobility of media professionals, and foster an environment conducive to media innovation and quality journalism; to establish a hub of broadcasters, media production companies, content creators, start-ups to R&D institutes and production companies across the Turkic world for collaboration, innovation policy and network building to create a greater impact; to encourage the production of movies, series, documentaries, cartoons, and audio materials reflecting commonalities, collective history and shared values of the OTS Member States.

The Cooperation with Civil Society Organizations emphasizes enabling environment for networking and joint work of civil society organizations (NGOs) from the OTS Member States with the aim of strengthening dialogue among them, and ensuring their active engagement in the socio-economic and political development of their respective countries; to involve civil societies in the activities of the OTS and the other Turkic Cooperation Organizations such as TURKPA, TURKSOY, Turkic Academy, and Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation to promote common values, foster dialogue and understanding and to boost people-to-people contacts within the region.

THE COOPERATION WITH EXTERNAL PARTIES

The Cooperation with External Parties pillar consists of two sections: (i) Cooperation with International Organizations, (ii) Humanitarian and Development Cooperation.

The Cooperation with International Organizations gives place to enhance cooperation with international and regional organizations, as well as third countries with a view to developing project-based and sectoral partnerships for common benefit and increase visibility and influence of the OTS as a reliable international actor; to strengthen institutional relations with UN and its bodies, Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC), Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and Conference on Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia (CICA), and establish new partnership relations with relevant regional institutions including the European Union (EU), Organization of the Black Sea Economic Cooperation (BSEC), Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO), and Visegrád Group; to conduct joint projects with UN specialized agencies and in partnership with other relevant stakeholders for implementing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in the Member States and across the globe; to ensure close coordination and joint actions to safeguard common interests of the OTS Member States in the framework of other international organizations.

The Humanitarian and Development Cooperation mentions to build relations with donor community to address the development needs of the Member States; to take joint action to channel official development assistance and lines of development credits of the OTS Member States for poverty eradication in the developing countries; to initiate a regular dialogue with the donor community and provide a regional perspective in donor assistance, thus align as much as possible the donor interventions with the needs and priorities identified within Vision 2040; to increase solidarity with the Global South and contribute to the South-South and triangular cooperation for the well-being of the countries and people of the South, their national and collective self-reliance and the attainment of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development; to carry out joint projects to link countries that have development needs with those Member States that have solutions, while enabling sharing of technical or economic knowledge and necessary skills.

ANALYZES OF TURKIC WORLD VISION – 2040

The Turkic World Vision – 2040 has a detailed framework and future vision as described above. The analysis of this comprehensive content of Turkic World Vision – 2040 is of particular importance for the future of the Turkic world.

First of all, it is seen that the Turkic World Vision – 2040 has been designed in accordance with the international system and international norms. In this context, the world order and international organizations, especially the UN (and the UN Treaty), and the emphasis on international peace and security, one of the basic concepts of international norms, and references to international law are extremely valuable. The reference by the Heads of States of OTS to

the concepts of international law, international peace, security, and welfare in the introduction to the Turkic World Vision – 2040 is an important emphasis reflecting this perspective. Likewise, the use of the concept of universal values in this section is an indication that the Turkic world has a political vision parallel to the international community and aims to be an active actor in the international system. It is stated that the Turkic World Vision – 2040 is determined through the commonality of the language, culture, and history of the Turkic peoples, and it is explained that the values of the Turkic people are in harmony with the universal values.

The Turkic World Vision – 2040 assigns a special role and task to the OTS and aims to strengthen both the member states nationally and the Turkic world as a whole, through four basic principles. In this context, these four basic principles (i) the political and security cooperation, (ii) economic and sectoral cooperation, (iii) people-to-people cooperation, (iv) cooperation with external parties are detailed in separate sections and sub-titles.

The Political and Security Cooperation section emphasizes the rule of law, and cooperation with other international organizations such as the EU, the UN, etc. In this context, the emphasis on cooperation in the fight against global crimes that threaten international peace and security, such as terrorism, drugs, human trafficking, weapons smuggling, and cybercrime, declares that the Turkic world will not be allowed to return to the field of action of international crimes and criminal organizations, in the next two decades. Baranyi (2022: 121-136) points out the unique position of Hungary, the member of the EU and the observer of the OTS: “In spite of their geographical distance, there are many issues of common interest among Hungary and different groupings of the OTS members. Since Hungary is a member of the EU and takes part in its decision-making processes, it could use its leverage to shape the EU agenda in a direction beneficial to a better understanding of the Turkic nations. In fact, there are a set of issues that could be addressed to the benefit of the OTS, the EU and Hungary, most prominently in the fields of security, migration, and energy.”

The Economic and Sectoral Cooperation section is important in terms of associating the historical, cultural and, social ties of the Turkic world with real politics and setting a concrete target on joint economic benefits. Supporting the existing partnerships of the Turkic states and the Turkic world with economic goals and projects will strengthen the cooperation, and the Turkic world will be an important regional/global actor with economic confidence. This economic vision, which was not at a sufficient level since 1991, has a vital importance in terms of political cooperation in the Turkic world. The Economic and Sectoral Cooperation pillar, going beyond being a superficial discourse in the Turkic World Vision – 2040, includes eight sections consisting of (i) economic cooperation, (ii) transport and customs, (iii) information and communication technologies, (iv) energy, (v) tourism, (vi) health, (vii) environment, and (viii) agriculture have been transformed into concrete cooperation targets.

The People-to-People Cooperation shows that the importance of civil society and the individuals, which is getting globally important and effective actors in the 21st century, has been recognized by the OTS. It is important that in addition to the NGOs (as associations, unions, foundations, etc.), the media organizations and diaspora societies are especially emphasized in the People-to-

People Cooperation section which consists of six sub-sections: (i) Culture, (ii) Education and Science, (iii) Youth and Sports, (iv) Diaspora, (v) Information and Media, (vi) Civil Society Organizations. The creation and/or strengthening of a human-centered social structure in the Turkic world in accordance with global trends is one of the most important and unique features of the Turkic World Vision – 2040.

The cooperation with external parties section shows that the Turkic world will cooperate with global actors and support the international community on humanitarian and development cooperation. It is extremely valuable to articulate cooperation with regional and global institutions such as the UN, EU, OIC, OSCE, ECO, and CICA, which are not only geographically wide but also diverse in their fields of activity.

Lastly, the most important shortcoming in the Turkic World Vision – 2040 is that both very little space and superficial discourses is given to issues such as democracy, human rights, fundamental rights and freedoms, women's rights, environmental rights, etc. It is expected that the Turkic world would also be assertive in these areas and that these claims would go beyond abstract and be detailed with concrete vision and projects. It is of vital importance to detect this important deficiency of the Turkic World Vision – 2040 and to make the Turkic world a regional and global actor that respects human rights and is above the global democratic standards.

In the context of the Turkic World Vision – 2040, Musabay Baki (2022: 48) draws attention to the historical roots of cooperation in the Turkic world and says:

The aim of building resilient societies and institutions must always be kept top of mind in the OTS, whatever cooperation area is at the stake. To this end, principles such as accountability, preparedness, readiness to adapt and responsibility should continue to be the anchors of Turkic cooperation. These solid principles have long resonated throughout the Turkic world. They appear in *Kutadgu Bilig* (Blessed Knowledge), written centuries ago in the Karakhanids age by Yusuf Has Hacib, a Turkic philosopher and writer from Balasagun. As a timeless work of Turkic literature dating back to the 11th century, this book and the values it enconces will keep on inspiring the visionary and resilient aspects of Turkic cooperation.

CONCLUSION

After the collapse of the USSR in 1991, five Turkic states (Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, and Turkmenistan) gained their independence. In addition to these new states, together with the Republic of Türkiye, which was founded in 1923, and the TRNC, which declared its independence in 1983 (but unfortunately is not recognized by any state other than the Republic of Türkiye) the idea of the Turkic world, which has a large geography and a large population, has started to be discussed. These discussions gained a concrete institutional structure with the establishment of the OTS by Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Türkiye in 2009 with the Nakhchivan Agreement. With the membership of Uzbekistan in 2019, the name change to

the Organization of Turkic States in 2021, and the participation of Hungary (2018), Turkmenistan (2021), and TRNC (2022) as observer members, the institutional structure of the Organization of Turkic States has completed its deficiencies and has become a more assertive actor in international politics. With the strengthening of the institutional structure, the political cooperation and future vision of the OTS have become even more important and this gap has been filled with the 2040 Turkic World Vision.

The Turkic World Vision – 2040, announced by the Heads of State of the Organization of Turkic States in order to guide the next phase of the Organization of Turkic States’ priorities, evolution, and direction in the next two decades, puts the cooperation between the member states of OTS on a solid political ground. In this context, the foundations of cooperation are laid in four main titles: (i) political and security cooperation, (ii) economic and sectoral cooperation, (iii) people-to-people cooperation, (iv) cooperation with external parties, and in eighteen sub-titles, cooperation is detailed. Yesevi (2022: 21) states that “Turkic World Vision – 2040 was prepared in detail and with great care; nonetheless, it has generated questions as to how all these aims will be accomplished.”

In this study, the cooperation institutions of the Turkic world have been examined and the institutional structuring process of the Organization of Turkic States has been elaborated in detail. In this context, the unique role of the Organization of Turkic States in ensuring cooperation in the Turkic world has been emphasized and its institutional expansion and political deepening since its establishment has been examined in detail. The Turkic World Vision – 2040 has been comprehensively analyzed in direct proportion to its importance for the future of the Turkic world. It is aimed that this study – with the aforementioned theoretical and practical background – will be a source for future studies on the change and institutionalization of the Turkic world, the OTS, and the Turkic World Vision – 2040.

REFERENCES

- Açikmese, Akgul S. (2004). "Uluslararası ilişkiler teorileri isiginda Avrupa butunlesmesi". *Uluslararası İlişkiler*, 1(1): 1-32.
- Balcer, Adam (2012). "Between energy and soft pan-Turkism: Turkey and the Turkic Republics". *Turkish Policy Quarterly*, 11(2): 151-162.
- Beylur, Suat (2021). "A New Turning Point in the Integration of the Turkic World: Turkic World Vision-2040", *Weekly e-Bulletin No. 331*, Eurasian Research Institute. Retrieved from <https://www.eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Weekly-e-bulletin-29.11.2021-05.12.2021-No-331.pdf>. Accessed: 12.05.2023.
- Baranyi, Tamás P. (2022). "Hungary's role in the Organization of Turkic States as an observer state: Limitations and opportunities". *Perceptions*, 27(1): 121-136.
- Kocaman, Omer (2021). "Cok taraflı is birliđi'nin karsilastigi zorluklar ve bolgesel uluslararası kurulusların artan onemi: Turk Konseyi ornegi". *Bağımsızlıklarının 30. Yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri-Bölgesel Politika*. Ankara: Nobel Yay.
- Kocatepe, Omer Faruk (2022). *Turk Devletleri Teskilati: Politik ve Askeri is Birliđi*. Ankara: Nobel Yay.
- Köstem, Seekin (2017). "When Can Idea Entrepreneurs Influence Foreign Policy? Explaining the Rise of the "Turkic World" in Turkish Foreign Policy". *Foreign Policy Analysis*, 13: 722-740.
- Mercan, Sezgin S. (2011). "Siyasal butunlesme kuramlari isiginda AB genislemesi". *Ankara Avrupa Çalışmaları Dergisi*, 10 (1): 67-83.
- Musabay Baki, Pelin (2022). "Turkic World Vision-2040: A step forward for the resilience of Turkic cooperation". *Perceptions*, 27(1): 26-52.
- Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic States (2023). "About TURKPA". Retrieved from <https://turk-pa.org/en>. Accessed: 02.04.2023.
- Schimmelfennig, Frank and Daniel C. Thomas (2011). "Normative institutionalism and EU foreign policy in comparative perspective". *International Politics*, 46(4):177-191.
- Schneider Gerald and Anastasia Ershova (2018). *Rational Choice Institutionalism and European Integration*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Suddaby, Roy, William M. Foster and Albert J. Mills (2014). *History and Institutions. Organizations in Time: History, Theory, Methods* (Ed. M. Bucheli ve D.Wadhvani). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- The International Organization of Turkic Culture (2023). "History". Retrieved from <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US>. Accessed: 02.04.2023.
- The International Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation (2023). "The International Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation (ITCHF)". Retrieved

from <https://itchf.org/en/>. Accessed: 02.04.2023.

The Organization of Turkic States (2020). “Nakhchivan Agreement”. Retrieved from <https://turkicstates.org/assets/dokuman/Nahngilizce1.pdf>. Accessed: 02.04.2023.

The Organization of Turkic States (2021). “Organization”. Retrieved from <https://www.turkicstates.org/en>. Accessed: 02.04.2023.

The Organization of Turkic States (2022). “Baghdad Amreyev is appointed as the President of the Turkic Investment Fund by the Leaders of OTS”. Retrieved from https://turkicstates.org/en/haberler/baghdad-amreyev-is-appointed-as-the-president-of-the-turkic-investment-fund-by-the-leaders-of-ots_2682. Accessed: 02.04.2023.

The Organization of Turkic States (2023). “The Turkic World Vision - 2040”. Retrieved from <https://turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/haberler/turkic-world-vision-2040-2396-97.pdf>. Accessed: 02.04.2023.

Yaldiz, Firat and Ayse Colpan Yaldiz (2020). “Turk kamu yonetiminde yeni kurumlar ve dis Politika: Türkiye-Kirgizistan iliskilerinde yeni kurumsalcilik (New institutions and foreign policy in Turkish public administration: New institutionalism in Turkey-Kyrgyzstan relations)”. *Amme İdaresi Dergisi*, 53(2): 75-97.

Yaldiz, Firat and Cinar Ozen (2021). “Türkiye – Turk cumhuriyetleri iliskileri (1991-2021) (Türkiye – Turkic republics relations (1991-2021))”. *Bağımsızlıklarının 30. Yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri-Küresel Politika*. Ankara: Nobel Yay. 15-38.

Yaldiz, Firat (2020). *Türk Dünyası Kültür Başkentleri*. (Ed.) Ankara: Nobel Yay.

Yesevi, Cagla Gul (2022). “Examining the organization of Turkic States: A teacher and norm-creator”. *Perceptions*, 27(1): 2-25.